

Minutes of Mongolia EITI MSWG Meeting (15 May 2013)

The 32nd meeting of Mongolia EITI MSWG began at 4 pm, 15 May 2013, in the Conference Hall of the Ministry of Mining.

Attending MSWG members: Ch. Otgochuluu (Mining Ministry Strategic Policy and Planning Department Chairman); B. Hulan (Mining Ministry Project Officer); E. Sumiya (Cabinet Secretariat Senior Officer); S. Battulga (Mineral Resource Authority Mining Department Chairman); D. Munhsaihan (Mineral Resources Authority Officer); G. Zulai (Finance Ministry Accounting Policy Department Officer); S. Bayartsetseg (Ministry of Environment and Green Development Officer); D. Enhtuya (General Tax Administration Inspector); N. Alгаа (Mongolian National Mining Association CEO); H. Lhamaa (Multilateral Cooperation OT LLC Officer); T. Munhbat (Mongolian Geology Association President); G. Urantsooj (Human Rights and Development Center NGO Head); N. Bayarsaihan (Steps Without Boundaries NGO Head); D. Tserenjav (Transparency Foundation CEO); B. Bayarmaa (Huvsgul Daialan Ezed NGO Head); L. Dolgormaa (Responsible Mining Initiative NGO Head); Ts. Tsolmon (MSWG Secretary and EITI Secretariat Coordinator); 17 of the 33 MSWG Members attended, with a quorum of 55%.

Invited guests: Emma Irwin (Adam Smith International Training Consultant); P. Oyunbileg (ASI Manager); G. Bazar (translator); B. Delgermaa (EITI Secretariat Communications Officer); A. Otgontungalag (EITI Secretariat Finance Manager).

EITI Secretariat Coordinator Sh. Tsolmon made opening remarks.

Sh. Tsolmon: Ch. Otgochuluu, Mining Ministry Department Chair, was originally to chair today's meeting, but he has asked me to kick off on his behalf as he has another meeting. So, shall we start? We have a quorum of 17 of the 33 members; Mr Gansuh has a commitment elsewhere and B. Oyun from the Petroleum Authority has sent her apologies. Shall we start? Anyone disagree?

Members: Let's start.

Sh. Tsolmon: First, Adam Smith International Training Consultant Emma Irwin will make a presentation. We will then hear a brief intro about the upcoming participation of Mongolian delegates at an International Conference in Sydney Australia in May 2013, before moving to the rest of the agenda. Anything to add or remove from the agenda? If not, I offer the floor to Emma Irwin.

I. TOPIC: Findings of training needs assessment for Mongolia EITI and draft training plan

Emma Irwin: I'm glad to see you again. I will make my presentation in English and it will be translated into Mongolian. Next time, I will try to improve my Mongolian and speak Mongolian. I will speak slowly in English, and it will be translated. My presentation has several sections. First, I will speak generally about the project. Second, I will talk about the training target sections/groups and the recommendations grounded on the survey I carried out in Mongolia in 2012. I will also give you our conclusions on the current work. I

will give more details about the training, and then we can discuss the training options and opportunities. So, let's start the presentation.

Currently, Adam Smith International is implementing 6 types of activity. One is the training program. This is in two sections: first assessment of training needs; and second, provision of a batch of proposed training courses to stakeholders. In Ulaanbaatar and Umnugobi province in 2012 I conducted a capacity and training needs survey, meeting many stakeholders. Then we identified the target groups, classified as government, company and civil society, and provided recommendations for each group (presentation attached).

The project was on standstill and did not run for some time. Now we are going to restart, with a focus on EITI law and training. During this visit, I am hoping to resolve all training-related issues. We aim to discuss multi-stakeholders and their unique training needs, and reach consensus on options and opportunities. I welcome any questions.

In my assessment, I divided training needs into two sections: in Ulaanbaatar and at the sub-national level, aimags and soum. Key recommendations are also in two sections: for Ulaanbaatar-based stakeholders and for rural (aimag and soum) stakeholders. This is included in the brief summary of the report which I delivered in January. If you need more detailed information, please check the report. At the sub-national level, it was found that people do not have adequate EITI information. Information is also insufficient at the national level, but less so than at the local level. Companies do not have sufficient information on how to fill out EITI reports, while only a few companies are reporting to EITI. They are not sufficiently aware of the EITI goals. As the number of companies reporting to EITI increases year to year, it is vital to educate and increase company awareness. The number of companies reporting payments to EITI has this year reached 1,500.

There is also a need to improve the understanding of civil society organizations. They must basically have an equal influence and it is vital to provide them with capacity building training. If you need any clarification of materials circulated to you, please ask.

E. Sumiya: The report is based on outdated data. You have not properly studied the present-day situation of Mongolia and its civil society organizations. As to the material that you sent us in 2011, we discussed and also had disagreement. Today, Mongolia has had a dedicated Mining Minister and Ministry. At present, two Mining Ministry departments are working on this issue, one responsible for EITI law, the other responsible for policy coordination. The government is paying considerable attention to the issue. This is why the number of reporting companies has reached 1,500. However, this also creates a need. Previously, Cabinet alone was responsible for all action; we now have all three stakeholders working together, suggesting ideas, followed by discussion and decision-making. Government, companies and civil society are represented, chairing EITI meetings in rotation. In other words, the initiative is already being implemented. Today, we want needs-based recommendations. Please focus on this. That is what I believe.

Emma Irwin: Thank you very much for your comments.

N. Alгаа: In my opinion, the recommendations are good. I understand that you met many stakeholders/people and your recommendations are based on their input. In the past, we

had templates to fill out, but we have already identified target groups and started implementation of the initiative, so I would not say it is all bad. Today, the stakeholders - government, NGOs and companies - are not aware of the issue we are discussing. That is why I say it is good that stakeholder target groups have been identified. We need to train officers of government agencies responsible for EITI. Some companies in extractive industry don't know anything except how to produce reports. The same with civil society, those participating in the EITI have some knowledge, but those not participating are not aware of the initiative. So I believe that our consultants have carefully studied these 12 types of training, made target groups aware of the context, and made recommendations.

N. Bayarsaihan: A considerable amount of the information in the report is outdated, back to 2011. We need to look at advocacy or influence in a different way to 2011. For instance, how we should further use EITI report data, how to use data for annual budgeting. As such, we must talk about how to make and use the report. At the local level, community groups have been established, but it is still not clear how they will expand or branch out. Government Resolution 80 and Resolution 222 have been issued. Now we need a training needs assessment driven by new conditions and new contexts. Our members offered proposals at a recent PWYP coalition meeting. For instance, they asked, are we checking or can check assets offered on the stock market? We also need to consider newly-emerging needs, I believe. Consultants arrived this year, but did not meet with civil society. However, this plan is well-made, focusing on target groups and offering several potential options.

Emma Irwin: Thank you very much for your comment.

H. Lhamaa: I suggest we add the media as one of the target groups, which might be useful in disseminating information to the public.

Emma Irwin: Now, I think I will summarize the presentation as reflecting your comments. The comments you have made are very valuable. First I would like to say thank you very much. I should also say the assessment I made covered the general scope. It identified what needs there are. On this visit, I have highlighted more changes and their context, rather than focusing on the 2011 assessment. So I have looked at the changes, and have proposed realistic options for training and other activities.

I would like to talk about the changes made up to this visit, by May 2013. First, more progress has been made since 2011, when we carried out some studies. I thought it important to raise public awareness on the initiative and its goals. Second, this assessment identified what needs to be done in Mongolia on EITI; and third, it was found necessary to inform the public about the EITI law and to stimulate dialogue. There are other issues, such as how to use the report and how to help citizens use report data effectively. The International EITI conference in Sydney next week will discuss overall EITI system and structure. This should make clearer the general structures of the EITI. The assessment also proposed alternatives on how to conduct 12 types of training.

The most important result of this visit is the package of 12 training courses, all of which were arrived at based on findings from 2011-2012 and 2013. We listed potential training courses, and included the most important. This also needs EITI Secretariat approval.

Ch. Otgochuluu: So let's finish with this topic, and move to the next.

Emma Irwin: The material circulated to you comprises 3 training packages, with 12 courses. I propose them as being most important in terms of target group and needs. We also believe they will best bring sustainable long-term outcomes. They include: Public Relations, Negotiation and Reaching Agreement; Training Trainers; and EITI Implementation; all three categories in the proposed training courses (plan attached).

We believe that these proposed training courses satisfy the needs of the changes. I would ask you to support and approve the proposed courses. If you disagree, we need to discuss today. All three training courses are to be implemented at the same time.

B. Delgermaa: 12 training courses means 12 days of training; in other words, each course for one day.

Sh. Tsolmon: We were in close agreement with Emma regarding the training. There is a very big need for training. However, we are not able to meet every need, so we have developed the three training packages, which is also consistent with our available funding. If the courses are approved, we will have more detailed programs. The Secretariat is supportive to the proposed training. We may be able to run the rural-based training with finance from the World Bank.

N. Bayarsaihan: I would say that the target groups are well identified. This says that 85,000 euros will be spent per course. My thought is, how do we set the number of participants or the number of training sessions? How do you arrive at the ratio? In terms of efficiency?

Emma Irwin: As with the first training course, there could be as many as 60 participants. But we planned to limit the number of trainees to maintain training effectiveness. If we have 60 participants at once, the training may be less effective.

N. Bayarsaihan: Is it possible to increase the frequency of training?

Emma Irwin: If we run training now, it can be repeated when more funds are available. You can discuss the training schedule and let me know later.

Ch. Otgonchuluu: Excuse me, I was delayed by a Ministry meeting, and I need to leave for another meeting at 6 pm. So, has anyone anything else to say about the training?

E. Sumiya: You promised to supply us with a meeting venue, and you should hurry us up. MSWG always has conducted extended discussion at its meetings.

Ch. Otgonchuluu: You can continue meeting in this room. I have another meeting.

N. Alгаа: Then you may leave after formally transferring your duty. Mr Sumiya says you may leave and we will continue our meeting.

Ch. Otgonchuluu: Let's take a break from the training topic, and hear a brief intro on the Minister's visit to Australia, scheduled next week.

Emma Irwin: My presentation will finish in couple of minutes. If it's OK, wait for a moment longer.

Sh. Tsolmon: OK, let's get back to training. We must discuss how many courses and which ones. EBRD has planned 12, and I hope that they will keep to this number. We have agreed on courses from the short list.

E. Sumiya: I have a question. It says that all trainers will be Mongolian: please comment on this.

Emma Irwin: We thought that a skilled and knowledgeable Mongolian trainer would be best and most effective for the training. Rather than someone like me coming to conduct training, Mongolian trainers would be more effective if they have the skills.

Oyunbileg: When we did the assessment, we understood that it is not necessary to have international trainers, considering the training and the topic.

E. Sumiya: In 2011 I asked for new training modules. Looks like they are unchanged. Why is this?

Emma Irwin: In 2011 we drew up just a general plan on how we run training and what type. We needed a different plan, looking at the situation from a different angle, so we have developed this new plan. We decided to have Mongolian trainers and enable them to develop their own training materials. Rather than having foreigner prepare everything, we aim to enable Mongolians to prepare for themselves.

There is also a trainer's practice section, when trainers can do exercises on developing training cases and content. Exactly what to do as part of the practice must be decided through discussion. Trainees could establish a working group for this purpose.

N. Alгаа: We ought to select trainers who are reliable and will stay in our organizations for a long time; for instance, two from our association and two from civil society. If trainers quit the job or simply disappear, the training will be less effective.

B. Bayarmaa: We need to increase the total number of trainers, maybe to 15.

N. Bayarsaihan: The number of trainers should be increased to 15; what if there are 10 trainers and 15 trainees?

Emma Irwin: You need to agree on what type of training and how many participants, and let us know. Adam Smith Director Jonathan is coming to Mongolia after the Sydney conference. You will need to discuss your choice of training package with him, and decided which training course and what budget.

N. Alгаа: We could remove one of the two training courses for companies and substitute a course for the media. How many training courses are there in the 12 packages?

Emma Irwin: One training course is one day of training. Five days of training is considered as 5 trainings. That is the number that we arrived at consistent with budget estimates. It could be changed a little bit.

N. Alгаа: All three packages include 12 training courses, do they?

Emma Irwin: Yes, 12 training courses in a total of 3 packages.

N. Bayarsaihan: It says 12 training courses, but does not say days.

E. Sumiya: That is one way to allocate the money.

N. Alгаа: Personally, I don't agree. We are still failing to acquire and implement knowledge. The government can only give recommendations. If we don't get this training, we will lose out. In particular, we need to train our trainers and spread knowledge further, ensuring that the 85,000 euros will be spent wisely and effectively. We should not be counting the money and saying it is more or less; instead we need to get that knowledge and localize it here.

T. Munhbat: Our trainers must be good trainers. Can they learn enough in 5 days? If not, they may be called as trainers, but won't be able to cope well. Five days is usually enough for specialists, but how adequate it is for training trainers?

N. Bayarsaihan: Five days is enough.

D. Tserenjav: I have a proposal. We say that the training is necessary because the overall knowledge on EITI is insufficient. We will be trained as trainers. We will also train each other. Instead, wouldn't it be more effective to run a workshop-seminar? For instance, on how to fill out the template and how to publicize the report?

N. Alгаа: This does not include the most important part, the seminar. We need run a seminar after each training course to reach understanding and agreement. This must be at a national level, attracting all stakeholders.

Emma Irwin: You can add your proposal.

E. Sumiya: The reason I do not agree is that you previously said companies are unaware, but here we are saying there is no need for training for companies.

Urantsooj: Training is needed everywhere and at all levels, particularly in rural areas.

E. Sumiya: Please include in the minutes that I am opposed.

2. TOPIC: Expenses for Mongolian delegates attending the International Conference, Sydney Australia, May 2013

Sh. Tsolmon: As you already have the conference agenda, I will give you just a brief intro. The EITI International Conference, held once every two years, will be in Sydney, Australia. There will be 1,000 delegates, with about 20 from Mongolia. There will also be several meetings, such as a Coordinators' Meeting and Communication Training-Workshop. Mining Minister D. Ganhuyag will attend the conference, will pay an official visit to Australia and have planned official talks about bi-lateral relations. He will also meet Mrs Claire Short. The conference is set to approve a new charter for the EITI. There will also be

an exhibition where participating countries will promote their activities, and the winners of EITI video contest will be announced. Mongolian representatives should take ads and leaflets of their organizations. The conference agenda was circulated in advance; you will find more detail there.

Ch. Otgochuluu: As to our Ministry position on the Sydney conference, we aim to broadly present first, what Mongolia is doing under EITI; second, analysis of discrepancies in the reports; and third, the upcoming EITI law.

Sh. Tsolmon: On 4 June, 2013, there will be a special event organized at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Mr Otgochuluu will tell us about this.

Ch. Otgochuluu: You have received invitations for the event, which will open with remarks from Mining Minister D. Ganhuyag, followed by an introduction on the Sydney conference and the present situation of the mining sector, then a dialogue on the EITI draft law. I must go to another meeting now, but invite you to continue this meeting. Thank you.

N. Bayarsaihan: Your officer Zuunnasat promised to send us a draft of the Government Policy on the Minerals Resource Sector, which we have not received. Can we have a copy?

Ch. Otgochuluu: Yes, you can have a copy. I will email it to the Secretariat. As to training, now we have a dedicated Mining Ministry. We have two officers at the MRAM working exactly on this issue, and we have a policy to increase staff numbers. As training is needed to disseminate the initiative, I fully support the training. Mr Hurelbat will give you more details about the Minister's visit.

L. Dolgormaa: The government promised to support responsible mining. Is it possible to include a training session on responsible mining for government agencies and NGOs?

Ch. Otgochuluu: Personally, I support the training courses. You should discuss how. I believe it should be optimal, which will give more results and outcomes.

N. Algaa: It says training on transparency.

L. Dolgormaa: I meant that the Ministry would not be able to include responsible mining training in this draft plan.

N. Algaa. If at least one principle is implemented well, it will likely help us to implement the other in the future.

Hurelbat: I will be brief. The Minister will leave for Sydney next week. This is the first visit by the Mining Minister to Australia. He has been invited by the Australian Mining Minister and will also attend the EITI Conference. He will attend the 4th meeting of the Australia-Mongolia Cooperation Society. His agenda on EITI is clear and has been explained to the Secretariat.

Sh. Tsolmon: OK, please integrate the comments and send us the final draft of the training plan. That concludes today's meeting. Thank you very much.

RESOLVED:

MSWG Meeting finished at 6.25 pm.

Minute reviewed by:

Sh. Tsolon,
MSWG Secretary and Secretariat Coordinator

Minutes taken by:

A. Otgontungalag
EITI Secretariat Finance Officer